

STRICTLY PRIVATE & CONFIDENTIAL

THE CITIZENS ASSEMBLY

MEETING SATURDAY, 30th SEPTEMBER 2017

HELD IN

THE GRAND HOTEL

MALAHIDE

COUNTY DUBLIN

SESSION 7: NATIONAL DIALOGUE ON CLIMATE CHANGE  
FEEDBACK FROM ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSIONS

1                   ROUNDTABLE DISCUSSION RESULTS COMMENCED AS FOLLOWS :

2  
3                   JUDGE LAFFOY: Now, what I'm about to do now is to open  
4                   the feedback session from this Roundtable Discussion.  
5                   To recap, the Assembly Members have spent the last 40  
6                   minutes brainstorming on the five questions which are  
7                   up on the screen as conversation starters which emerged  
8                   from the past paper which Brian Carroll presented. So  
9                   what we are going to do now and this is obviously an  
10                  observation mainly for the observers, this is not a  
11                  question and answer session, what we are going to get  
12                  now is the feedback and we are going to go around each  
13                  table and the Facilitator on the table will give us an  
14                  outline of the views of the people at the table.

15  
16                  So, it is really about the key topics which emerged  
17                  during the discussion and it may be necessary for the  
18                  Facilitators to elaborate on some points raised and it  
19                  may be that the members may want to get involved. If a  
20                  member wants to get involved, bear in mind you have to  
21                  be brief. We just want to get an overview and this  
22                  overview is going to be very important I think and  
23                  there is a stenographer here and in due course there  
24                  will be a transcript and I think it will be of  
25                  importance to the Advisory Group from whom we got these  
26                  questions and I think it is very important.

27  
28                  So we will start I think with Table 14 -- I will start  
29                  with Table 1.

1 FACILITATOR TABLE 1: I am the Facilitator for table  
2 one. There were quite a number of answers to question  
3 one. A lot of them revolved around the issue of the  
4 scale of the issue, the timelines are often so far in  
5 the future that people think in the present and find it  
6 hard to identify the concept that it is someone else's  
7 problem or that someone's individual input can be too  
8 small. People have enough to worry about in their  
9 general lives and also that many Green solutions are  
10 associated with higher taxes and in particular  
11 inconsistent taxes such as the previous tax on petrol  
12 which gave rise to a rise in diesel cars and now diesel  
13 cars are to be taxed in turn.

14  
15 In response to Question Two, the main idea that  
16 captivated the table which crosses two, three and four  
17 is the idea of having either an equivalent agency to  
18 the Citizens Information Centres or to expand the  
19 Citizens Information Centres to provide Green materials  
20 including information on appropriate recycling  
21 materials, appropriate information booklets and the  
22 like. So that that information is distributed across  
23 Ireland on an informational basis. It was also noted  
24 that the dispersed population makes it very difficult  
25 for people to become that Green and that the price of  
26 public transport must be reduced.

27  
28 In relation to Question Three the only observation  
29 aside from the previous one is that it should be a

1 grass roots effort.

2  
3 In relation to Four, emphasis should be placed on  
4 targeting younger children so that they grow up  
5 believing in Green Life.

6  
7 And in relation to Number Five, its important to change  
8 the planning regulations so that the public become more  
9 Green efficient. Dublin Bus and other public  
10 organisations should play their part. When  
11 refurbishing buildings it should be mandatory to make  
12 them more environmental and individuals have the  
13 obligation to educate others and there should also be  
14 show houses to demonstrate Green energy so people can  
15 see what changes they can make in their own lives.

16  
17 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Very good, thank you very much.  
18 Is Table Two ready. Yes, thank you.

19  
20 FACILITATOR TABLE 2: Table Two for question one, they  
21 said, do not understand the signs, overwhelmed by the  
22 information, too big a problem, scary, fear, is  
23 demotivating. Some think the damage is done, its too  
24 late and that actually consumers switch off partly  
25 because of the way certain devices in their homes are  
26 plugged in like TV devices and you have to leave them  
27 on all the time or you can't switch those sort of  
28 things off and that sort of initiative maybe could be  
29 looked at.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29

For Question Two, bureaucracy of administration, difficult to access existing initiatives, lack of factual information.

For Number Three, submissions to the National dialogue, feedback on the suggestions, clarity on relevant Government Department looking after issues.

For Number Four, all of the above, show positives rather than the negatives. Sustain the Green initiatives beyond the schools, bring it out into the communities.

And for Number Five, Public Authorities should lead by example. Tidy Towns business model replicated to a Green initiative, carbon neutral buildings should get initiatives. And one of the Citizens would actually like to make a statement on it as well.

CITIZEN 1 TABLE 2: I just wanted to say that in regard to the questions that were asked, I just felt that there should also be an obligation on the Government to lead by example and that how can ordinary people be expected to take action on climate change when as we've heard today we are failing to meet our own obligations to reduce emissions and we seem to instead to be more focussed on excuses as to why we can't meet these obligations. If our Government has to be dragged kicking and screaming to take action on climate change,

1 what kind of example does that set for ordinary Irish  
2 Citizens.

3  
4 [APPLAUSE]

5  
6 CITIZEN 2 TABLE 2: I Just want to add on to that,  
7 because the public service, we have a public service in  
8 Ireland with 280,000 employees that are housed in their  
9 work place every day. Public Authorities and Public  
10 Service needs to lead by example. So it is a follow on  
11 from this comment. The Government should implement a  
12 carrot and stick approach with regard to how  
13 Departments are funded. If a Department meets targets  
14 with regards to low carbon emissions, then they should  
15 be rewarded and they should receive extra funding to  
16 continue with this work and if a Department fails to do  
17 so, then they should be punished for it. It's as  
18 simple as that. Incentives, for carbon neutral  
19 buildings should be the norm including retrofit of  
20 existing legacy buildings. We have a lot of buildings  
21 in the country that are leaking power, day and night  
22 and they can be converted to carbon neutral buildings  
23 and we will see tomorrow of an example of a fire  
24 station which did it. Thank you.

25 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you.

26  
27 FACILITATOR TABLE 3: There has been a number of  
28 suggestions for Question 1, first of all the answer was  
29 'yes' that people do feel that they are switched off

1 and the first reason is that fatigue at listening at  
2 constant bad news and it just feels abstract. Thoughts  
3 of making personal changes can be difficult and also  
4 expensive. People are currently embedded in practices  
5 that are unfriendly to the environment so again that is  
6 related to change. It doesn't feel personal it feels  
7 more abstract. People are more concerned with the here  
8 and now, so their daily living, getting on with things  
9 then future events. Feeling of impotence like 'what  
10 can I do' kind of scenario. Feel it is more at  
11 national and industrial level where the real changes  
12 can be made. Making changes more easily for people and  
13 particularly as people are getting older. Say for the  
14 adaptation of their houses and maybe putting in solar  
15 panels and that type of thing. All those things are  
16 difficulties and obstacles.

17  
18 For Question Two, again it was the making of personal  
19 changes, making that more easily and improving our  
20 public transport system.

21  
22 For Number Three on the communication, we were saying  
23 local forums and having the knowledge of knowing where  
24 to go for communication and with communication.

25  
26 For Number Four then regarding advertisements, this  
27 table thought maybe TV advertisement, making  
28 information more accessible, how to get it. Town Halls  
29 was one that there was a high regard for. Schools and

1 education at a young age say in transition years and  
2 say civil projects and that. Also pod casts and live  
3 streaming.

4  
5 And for Question Five then, public authorities, we see  
6 their role as to legislate and to facilitate. Perhaps  
7 set up a car pooling lane for changes. For the private  
8 sector to encourage companies that would employ 500+ to  
9 set up a bus sharing system where they can shuttle  
10 people back and forth to work and for civil society the  
11 suggestion was that a National Day, say where there  
12 would be an award made similar to what's done for the  
13 Tidy Towns at the moment. The suggestion was maybe to  
14 have a day like a Green Day or that and to have the  
15 award made that day and where it would be awarded that  
16 the town or the locality would be called 'Cool' town  
17 and that it would be an award that would engage  
18 communities from school children upwards. And finally  
19 just for individuals again, life changing events.

20 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much.

21 FACILITATOR TABLE 4: The citizens of table 4 felt that  
22 with regard to switching off, they felt that people  
23 feel that they are not empowered to make a change  
24 individually and that their contribution is a drop in  
25 the ocean. With regard to the challenges they felt  
26 that the costs were prohibitive and the complexity of  
27 the challenges is a disincentive. With regard to  
28 communicating with the local representatives, social  
29 media and other community based groups that deal with

1 these civic things that they are civic minded people  
2 who engage with this issue. They felt that that would  
3 be really helpful if they could get involved with other  
4 groups such as the Tidy Towns. With regard to  
5 engagement, they felt that there should be a robust  
6 public service announcement and media programme. For  
7 example advertisements on television and social media  
8 that there just isn't enough of them and that people  
9 are not engaging with it because they are not familiar  
10 with it. There is some but not enough.

11  
12 With regard to initiatives, with regard to Number Five  
13 they felt that there should be initiatives for  
14 recycling. All packaging needs to be recycled,  
15 everything that comes into the house should be capable  
16 of being put into your green bin and that recycling was  
17 the responsibility of everybody. Every single member  
18 of society, we should all be doing it and there should  
19 be more information on how to dispose of things  
20 properly.

21 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much. We will go  
22 to Table Five now.

23 FACILITATOR TABLE 5: Table Five on Question One, for  
24 the ordinary person the language is too scientific, the  
25 scale of the problem is too big. Also there is a lack  
26 of guidance and leadership from Government and the  
27 problem always seems to be far away and effecting  
28 others rather than at a local level.

29

1 On Question Two, the cost of upgrading current housing  
2 stock on an individual basis. Also lack of information  
3 on how to mitigate climate change.

4  
5 On Three, there should be an online portal with a  
6 National Information Campaign rolled out to allow  
7 people communicate more easily.

8  
9 On Four, a National Campaign to highlight National and  
10 local effects of climate change. That climate change  
11 is causing now in local areas i.e. your county, your  
12 village etc., similar to the photographs shown during  
13 the presentation.

14  
15 And on Five, a similar approach that was taken to  
16 plastic bags and the smoking ban e.g. bring in  
17 legislation and enforce it. A Citizen at the table  
18 would also like to make a statement on behalf of some  
19 of the members of the table.

20 CITIZEN 1 TABLE 4: Thanks. I'm just making a small  
21 statement on behalf of the table, most of the people at  
22 the table and it kind of reiterates what was being said  
23 at Table 2. It was disappointing that no Q&A would  
24 take place from the speaker from the National  
25 Mitigation Plan and Adaptation Framework. This damages  
26 the entire purpose of why we are here because  
27 essentially they are product of the Department of  
28 Environment and Communications who are refusing to  
29 engage and communicate. I was particularly

1 flabbergasted by the fact that we couldn't ask him  
2 questions. I don't understand but in addition to that  
3 we lack leadership and it's very evident for the last 20  
4 to 30 years on this. The Government could lead by  
5 example which it is not doing and implement actions  
6 rather than just speaking about them and looking for  
7 extra reports to be produced. I understand it is very  
8 important for research and documentation to be done and  
9 finding the best way to do things, but to be starting  
10 it in 2017 is shameful. What's wrong with having  
11 hospitals having solar panels for example? Why can't  
12 they lead by example? People have shown that you can  
13 actually save money. In addition to fixing the climate  
14 change through mitigation, we would be saving money. I  
15 mean it's -- I'm getting lost for words because -- and  
16 they are asking why people will switch off. If the  
17 Government is seen as not even willing to lead and they  
18 are actively refusing to lead, you switch off. Why  
19 should you do it yourself if the Government won't even  
20 do it and they are in a stronger position to do so.  
21 Thank you.

22  
23 [APPLAUSE]

24  
25 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Can I just say that it was a  
26 decision of the Chair and the Secretariat that this  
27 session would be a brainstorming session with a view to  
28 hopefully assisting the Advisory Group and there was  
29 nothing sinister about the fact that there wasn't a

1 Q&A. This is the format we thought was the correct  
2 format for today and in particular for the last  
3 sessions today. I just want to make that absolutely  
4 clear. Yes thank you.

5 FACILITATOR TABLE 6: The Citizens at Table 6 in  
6 relation to Question One, they felt that there was a  
7 lack of information, that people get bored and feel  
8 powerless, the sheer scale of information, graphs and  
9 figures are complicated and very technical. It doesn't  
10 resonate with people in their daily lives and it needs  
11 to be presented in a simpler and more engaging format.  
12

13 In relation to Question Two the Citizens felt it  
14 requires effort and it requires change of mind set. On  
15 an individual level it is expensive.  
16

17 Question Three the Citizens felt meetings and Town  
18 Halls to discuss the issue and talking to local TD's.  
19

20 Question Four, the Citizens felt that the Government  
21 should take leadership, legislators, TD's should  
22 purchase electric cars and encourage people to do the  
23 same. One Citizen felt when the Government engages  
24 with people about climate change, they should link  
25 natural disasters to how it impacts on people living in  
26 Ireland.  
27

28 Question five, the Citizens felt that it should start  
29 from the top down. The Government needs to lead with

1 example. The private sector needs to be held  
2 accountable. Authorities need to help those who have  
3 been effected by flooding and it should be made easier  
4 for people to reduce their carbon footprint for  
5 example, give grants for solar panels etc.

6 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you. Now we are moving to  
7 Table Seven.

8 FACILITATOR TABLE 7: I might be reiterating what some  
9 of my colleagues have said but I will say them anyway.  
10 The first one there a serious attitude change needs to  
11 be preceded and individuals need to know how it affect  
12 them. Some people feel they are too small to make a  
13 difference and they need to be re educated.

14  
15 The second point, it's been said before, the  
16 prohibitive cost of solar panels. Fuel boilers with a  
17 grant, it can be cheaper to do it without the grant.  
18 Profiteering of state bodies, no price control and  
19 their needs to be incentives and there needs to be long  
20 term benefit similar to the recycling companies  
21 penalizing people for putting the wrong rubbish in the  
22 wrong bins.

23  
24 Number Three, an independent website. One point of  
25 information that would cover grants, all information  
26 about saving heat etc., and frequently asked questions.

27  
28 Number Four, the Government successfully succeeded in  
29 getting rid of CFC gases, smokelless fuel, plastic bags

1 and unleaded fuel in cars. So they feel that it is up  
2 to the Government to make the moves in this area.

3  
4 Lastly, public authorities should lead by example.  
5 Only Government policy can make significant change to  
6 transport, energy and investment planning. One example  
7 they gave about Government was that the CCJ, they  
8 should have used solar panels instead of glass. Every  
9 little thing each individual does will help. Thank  
10 you.

11 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Very good, very good. Thank you  
12 very much. Table Eight.

13 FACILITATOR TABLE 8: The Citizens at this table  
14 reiterate a lot of the things that have already been  
15 said. In respect of the first question they do agree  
16 that citizens generally tend to switch off on hearing  
17 this issue. They feel that this is by reason of the  
18 fact that there is nothing they can do about it. They  
19 feel that it is nothing to do with them or that it is  
20 too far, the problems stem too far into the future.  
21 The issue is always expressed in very general terms.  
22 Also, it hasn't directly effected a lot of people in  
23 this country perhaps flooding and other issues tends to  
24 be in localised areas.

25  
26 In respect of the second question, the main challenges  
27 facing communities and individuals the Citizens at this  
28 table feel that one issue is getting politicians to  
29 listen to them, bureaucracy can be a challenge, people

1 individually don't feel empowered. People are willing  
2 to be led and they feel that they are not being led and  
3 the response is not coordinated, for example we've  
4 heard about the fact that there are cattle and peat  
5 subsidies.

6  
7 In respect of the third question, how can individuals  
8 and communities best communicate their concerns. There  
9 was a suggestion that individuals should be able to  
10 approach local government, local councillors whereas  
11 groups or more collective bodies should approach the  
12 Department of Environment directly. Local Councils  
13 should have a forum. There should be a network at both  
14 levels. So there should be intergovernmental  
15 committees between governments of different countries  
16 but then the Government should also consult with local  
17 sub-committees in Ireland.

18  
19 The Fourth Question, how should the Government engage  
20 with people. In agreement with a lot of other tables,  
21 schools were felt to be an appropriate locus and  
22 examples were raised in the past of good initiatives by  
23 the Government in respect of recycling, the smoking ban  
24 and indeed drink driving advertising is good in that  
25 respect. The Government should be more authoritative,  
26 it should lay down the law, the Government needs to  
27 take initiative and emphasize that there will be benefits  
28 in the long run.

29

1 Finally Question Five, the different roles for  
2 different actors. Politicians need to be held  
3 accountable for their decisions. From National Level  
4 there should be consultations with local councils and  
5 local councils should have climate change on their  
6 agenda every month. But at the National Level, this is  
7 important because it will facilitate a coordinated  
8 approach. At present there is no infrastructure for  
9 alternatives and this again would emphasize the role of  
10 National Level and then stemming from National  
11 coordination, the National Level would be important to  
12 give incentives to local government and individuals.  
13 Again grants for carrying out carbon reducing work on  
14 homes. The National Level should encourage education  
15 programme, awareness raising, competitions for  
16 initiatives, incentivize car pooling and again the  
17 Government should lead by example.

18 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much. We are  
19 moving to table nine now I think.

20 FACILITATOR TABLE 9: Thanks. At Table Nine we kind of  
21 rolled a few into one. If people switch off we feel it  
22 is due to the lack of leadership from the Government.  
23 We've known this is coming and nothing has been done  
24 for the last ten years. So, we feel the Government  
25 should announce a plan one which will actually be  
26 implement to include ten major initiatives subject to  
27 time limits perhaps 2020. For example complete  
28 electrification of transport within a reasonable  
29 timeframe. That one not 2020. All new bills subject

1 to minimum standards such as inclusion of solar panels.  
2 New industrial buildings should include living roofs  
3 where possible. Support and incentivize hydroponic  
4 farming, land fill waste reduction, replace peat  
5 harvesting with solar panels on that same land, move  
6 towards plastic free supermarkets, paper bags for fruit  
7 and veg etc. The free recycling of plastic and  
8 encourage the planting of native trees on farmland and  
9 incentive the same.

10  
11 Just with regard to Question Four we weren't really  
12 interested on how the Government wanted to engage with  
13 the public on the issue, we felt that's not the issue,  
14 we want them to act on what's already in front of them.

15  
16 [APPLAUSE]

17  
18 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Very good thank you very much.  
19 Now we are on Table Ten.

20 FACILITATOR TABLE 10: Judge, for the answer to Number  
21 One, the message is not clear enough. People don't  
22 understand as the numbers in the public domain don't  
23 sound serious i.e. 1% increase does not sound very  
24 serious. It doesn't seem like it's a priority, no  
25 strong leadership from Government on climate change.

26  
27 Number Two, there is no real ownership of problems. No  
28 Government support. The cost of making home  
29 improvements is often cost prohibitive.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29

Number Three, lobby politicians and EPA. County Councils should be involved. The equivalent of Tidy Towns for climate change.

Number Four, TV advisement and programmes. Educating adults and children and make the problem real.

And for Number five, incentive by realistic grants for home insulation, easier to access grants for a single item and tree planting, having client ambassadors.

MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much. Table 11 now.

FACILITATOR TABLE 11: Thank you Judge. In response to Question One, it was highlighted that people noted that there was a cost both financially and otherwise and this is partially why they may switch off and also the approach to the view that it doesn't affect the current moment and that it is somewhere down the road and this might be why people don't necessarily take it as serious. The scale of the problem that some people may find it intimidating was raised. It was raised by a member that there is lack of leadership and it would be possibly better if it was coming from the Taoiseach the issues of climate change and that people might take it more serious then. The issue of media was raised in relation to this as well that there is no large scale campaigns and also about the Paris Agreement that not enough people know about it and all them reasons could

1 be possibly why people switch off.

2  
3 In response to Question Two, the reasons of costs and  
4 money were raised again and for example for challenges  
5 the expense of solar panels and all that sort of  
6 equipment was raised. Lack of information, lack of  
7 leadership and lack of resources was also raised and  
8 that people sometimes just don't necessarily buy into  
9 the whole issue of climate change.

10  
11 In relation to Question Three it was suggested by a  
12 member of the table that local communities work to  
13 organise themselves and form a delegation and it was  
14 raised by another member that maybe local communities  
15 or individuals would be better to ring Joe Duffy if  
16 they had an issue to really express concern or get the  
17 matter raised.

18  
19 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: In other words, tell it to Joe!

20  
21 FACILITATOR TABLE 11: In response to Question Four and  
22 Government engagement, the members agreed with the  
23 points in the question that Town Hall meetings, social  
24 media, TV and radio and advertising was a good approach  
25 to take. It was highlighted by a member that it should  
26 start with children and inform them in a fun way the  
27 issues of climate change. The establishment of a  
28 National organisation with central communications to  
29 spread word on climate change issues was raised and it

1 was raised by a member -- a suggestion from a member  
2 was to remove the carpark that is provided free to all  
3 TD's both past and present in Leinster House and this  
4 should be done at once to encourage the TD's and the  
5 people in Leinster House would use public transport or  
6 cycling methods as well.

7  
8 [APPLAUSE]

9  
10 In response to Question Five, it was raised by a member  
11 at the table that hospitals could take a lead in  
12 efficiency and to look at taking small steps to make  
13 them Greener, in such areas as recycling. The reasons  
14 for this is to improve cost/efficiency not only for the  
15 hospitals but they could also provide financial  
16 incentives. Just to make hospitals greener they could  
17 take an approach of leading the way forward. It was  
18 suggested as well that in the private sector companies  
19 should be encouraged to draw up their own plans on how  
20 to be greener and this would lead to positive PR.  
21 Local authorities have a role to play here was  
22 highlighted by a member and that they should lead on  
23 energy efficiency particularly in the likes of street  
24 lighting and areas such as that. It was highlighted by  
25 a member of the table in relation to shopping centres  
26 with specific reference to the Dundrum shopping centre.  
27 The member actually lives quite close to it and the  
28 member highlighted that the centre is lit up 24 hours a  
29 day. The lights are constantly on and it has a massive

1 cost that should be addressed. So they suggested that  
2 companies should be encouraged to turn off lights or  
3 possibly fined if they are not meeting certain targets.  
4

5 The Green Schools Action Expo should be rolled out to  
6 all schools around the country. This was highlighted  
7 by a member. The use of the carbon footprint  
8 calculated was also highlighted by another member and  
9 better engagement from the EPA was also raised in  
10 relation to this. A member has also asked me to state  
11 a plan or an idea that they had and they felt that the  
12 idea of setting up green hubs or climate change hubs  
13 around the country in communities to provide  
14 information and act as a method of engagement and that  
15 they should take the approach of starting local and  
16 building it up with pop up educational hubs to inform  
17 people and raise awareness using the likes of  
18 technology such as apps for communication and to spread  
19 the campaign and also that they should engage with  
20 school children and with specific reference to  
21 transition year students.

22 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much. Then table  
23 12 I think.

24 FACILITATOR TABLE 11: Sorry Judge, the member Judge  
25 just wants to speak for one second. What the member  
26 wants to highlight is that the climate change  
27 calculator should be made available to all citizens for  
28 their use.

29 FACILITATOR TABLE 12: Thank you Judge, in relation to

1 Question Number One, Citizens at this table had a  
2 number of comments on all questions. People don't  
3 understand and are overwhelmed by the scale. It is not  
4 about us, it is a problem for the next generations.  
5 There is no sense of urgency generated. Looking at  
6 dates of 2050 there is an absence of short term focus.  
7 There is also an educational gap in providing people  
8 with practical examples of what people can do to act in  
9 the short terms to address this issue. There is an  
10 absence of leadership from the top. Meaning from  
11 Government level and there is also it is not helped by  
12 the negative policies of some TD's.

13  
14 In relation to Question Number Two, the main challenge  
15 is seen as cost and for individuals the grant  
16 structures are seen as not being a sufficient incentive  
17 around improving homes for example and that they are  
18 too little. It seems like there is an onus on the  
19 private sector to address this that is not matched by  
20 Government. A further challenge is in the area of  
21 prioritisation and that climate change has to compete  
22 with other issues such as, more immediate issues, such  
23 as homelessness.

24  
25 In relation to Question Number Three about how  
26 individuals and communities could best communicate  
27 their concerns it is by their own actions for example  
28 the walk to school scheme, the example of the fire  
29 station that has been discussed a couple of times and

1 will be discussed tomorrow and individuals and  
2 communities are exemplary to other communities.

3  
4 In relation to Question Number Four and in relation to  
5 Government, again by their own actions both  
6 individually and collectively for example the use of  
7 Ministerial cars that such cars should be more  
8 environmentally vehicles. Advertising campaigns  
9 focussing on benefits to the individuals of taking  
10 certain actions. School education programmes, starting  
11 at primary school should be action based education  
12 where they are examples for people and in this way kids  
13 can educate the adults. There should be more  
14 engagement with people on social media as some people  
15 are too busy to be attending Town Hall meetings on this  
16 topic.

17  
18 In relation to Number Five, there is a suggestion that  
19 there should be a prohibition on Ministers for a period  
20 after they leave office from entering the private  
21 sector in non-environmentally friendly companies. In  
22 relation to individuals the suggestion there is to move  
23 to the bike and to move to public transport and the  
24 expenses structure for the public sector and for the  
25 Oireachtas is seen as one that favours car usage.  
26 Public authorities generally should be leading by  
27 example and an example of that was an Inclusion Week  
28 which was a community based activity in a local  
29 authority. Finally climate change should take

1 precedence over public sector activity. Thank you  
2 Judge. Over the Private sector -- thank you.

3 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Yes and then Table 13.

4 FACILITATOR TABLE 13: Judge, some of the observations  
5 from table 13 in relation to Number One it was seen as  
6 not relevant. There was a general negativity around  
7 climate change and talk about it, volumes of  
8 information, overwhelming and it was described as a  
9 boring topic maybe to the younger generation and one  
10 comment was, 'I'm only one', there is a sense of  
11 individual helplessness about it. Recommendations or  
12 suggestions again education was brought into this to  
13 make it more immediate to lifestyle. One Citizen used  
14 the analogy of the smoking ban, drink driving, these  
15 campaigns were successful and this requires a cultural  
16 change as well. The Green Party, were described as a  
17 joke and that some of this was too long terms and  
18 described as Horizon Planning. Solar Panels,  
19 incentivised measures like this a bit more with tax  
20 breaks. The cost of energy again is an issue.

21  
22 Number Two relating to challenges facing communities,  
23 there doesn't seem to be a structure in place that  
24 people can use to do things about improving our  
25 emissions and climate change. And as individuals using  
26 cars for most people is unavoidable because basically  
27 where they live there is no public transport.

28  
29 Number Three, communication again is still sometimes

1 being done through the local TD. Letters might be  
2 written but you can be guaranteed that no responses is  
3 the most likely outcome. Parish councils were talked  
4 about, Tidy Towns Committees and so on but I think the  
5 lack of structure was a big problem here. People don't  
6 seem to know how to go about this as a group and as  
7 individuals.

8  
9 In relation to Number Four there was a suggestion about  
10 campaigns, they should be reduced, you know to reduce  
11 emission targets etc, campaigns should be more bite  
12 size and manageable, more short term. In relation to  
13 the Government's approach in communicating to the  
14 community, it should be sort of an interdepartmental  
15 approach with one harmonized message across all  
16 departments.

17  
18 And in relation to Number Five, a lack of leadership,  
19 that we should be making more demands on our local  
20 authorities and one citizen pointed out that a company  
21 called Uber were refused a licence to operate in Dublin  
22 recently and they are a sort of taxi pooling business  
23 and that companies like this should be allowed to trade  
24 and there should be further penalties -- there is  
25 another suggestion as well for companies who don't  
26 minimise on their packaging. And there is also a  
27 citizen at this table who would like to make a  
28 contribution.

29 CITIZEN TABLE 13: Thank you Paul. I think Judge it is

1 true to say from the comments that the temperature at  
2 the table as we were discussing these issues rose by  
3 several degrees celsius but I am glad to report that  
4 there were no extreme events following that!

5  
6 I think Paul covered extremely well the points. There  
7 is just one point that we were very strong about and  
8 that was the lack of structure. It's been referred to  
9 by several people at several tables. I live in  
10 Newbridge and we have about 26,000 people. If you take  
11 Newbridge and the surrounds. We are twinned with three  
12 different cities. One in Germany, one in France and  
13 one in the US and when we visit those we can see  
14 exactly what is missing in our society and it is  
15 democratic representation at an executive level at town  
16 and village and rural area. We don't have it. They  
17 have it and as a result they would not be having a  
18 forum like this because this is a very positive forum  
19 but it is trying to capture the actual democratic voice  
20 of people with regards because there is no way of  
21 capturing it in Newbridge. There is no body structure  
22 in the town to capture. So if the Government wants to  
23 talk to us they must speak to the local authority who  
24 is the body that's in the area that will correspond  
25 with the population in that county. There is no  
26 authority in any -- whether it's Athlone, whether it's  
27 Mullingar, Listowel, there is no authority in any town  
28 to represent the people democratically and this covers  
29 Question Two, Three, Four and Five. So, really the

1 addressing the climate change action by everybody to me  
2 is responsibility by nobody. You need leadership, you  
3 need executive function. It is very clear it is the  
4 responsibility of Government. It is through the local  
5 authorities if we don't change structures to give the  
6 power and the authority to people in towns and villages  
7 to actually have a structure where they have an  
8 executive function not just an input into a document.  
9 Thank you.

10  
11 [APPLAUSE]

12  
13 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much. Finally  
14 Table 14.

15 FACILITATOR TABLE 14: Good evening Judge. In respect  
16 of Question Number One, the table noted that there is  
17 too much doom and gloom in relation to climate change  
18 and they felt that it is an absolute lack of positive  
19 reinforcement. Furthermore they felt that there was a  
20 lack of financial incentive for people to get actively  
21 involved with climate change. They felt that if a  
22 person amends their lifestyle to reduce their carbon  
23 footprint, there doesn't seem to be any reference to  
24 any grants or rebates or tax rebates available to them.

25  
26 In respect to question number two they note that there  
27 is a lack of connection between the various Government  
28 departments. They felt that there is an overreliance on  
29 the car in respect of transportation. The Government

1 appears to overly invest in roads whereas public  
2 infrastructure and public transportation appears to be  
3 ignored. A further challenge they noted that where the  
4 citizens wished to rely on public transportation with a  
5 view to minimising the use of a car they had three  
6 problems with public transportation. Number one, there  
7 is a degree of a lack of trust in it regarding running  
8 times and its availability. Number two they felt that  
9 public transportation is quite expensive for the  
10 service they receive and number three in respect to  
11 Citizens, particularly in rural areas, they felt there  
12 is an inaccessibility to public transportation.

13  
14 Regarding Number Three, they felt that Local Councils  
15 and Local Authorities, they play a big role in both  
16 encouraging the communities and also listening to the  
17 concerns of the citizens. The Citizens at this table  
18 went out of their way to say that the Tidy Towns and  
19 similar such organisations are very good inspiration.  
20 They felt that the Tidy Towns and such like had quite  
21 reasonable success and that was on the basis of  
22 positive reinforcement. They felt that the people who  
23 got involved in these matters and the community  
24 engagement they were shown what was the positive action  
25 to do rather than being told about negative and what  
26 not to do.

27  
28 Furthermore in respect of point Number Three, they note  
29 financial incentives, they felt that if they can see a

1 benefit in their pocket they would certainly research  
2 the matter themselves and they would quickly learn  
3 about it far quicker than any other marketing  
4 campaigns. They also noted regarding the graphics of  
5 worse case scenarios, they felt there was some merits  
6 to that but again the graphics will only work where  
7 they go hand in hand with positive reinforcement and  
8 the individuals are told what they are to do in order  
9 to avoid such issues.

10  
11 In respect to Number Five, they note that it may be a  
12 matter for public authorities to look into trialling  
13 pilot projects for self sufficient hands. I note some  
14 of the Citizens at the table suggested that there's  
15 smaller towns in Europe where they aim towards being  
16 self sufficient. They were unsure whether or not there  
17 is some towns in Ireland that may be available or  
18 trialling this role but they felt that this was  
19 something that the public authority should look in to.

20  
21 And finally one of the Citizens at the table noted that  
22 they were quite disappointed that American and a  
23 certain President of America has not engaged or fully  
24 ignored the Paris Agreement and they felt that they  
25 were concerned that this might water down the attitude  
26 of other countries towards the Paris Agreement.

27  
28 MS. JUSTICE LAFFOY: Thank you very much.  
29